

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

505 VAN NESS AVENUE

SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3298



October 21, 2020

Edward N. Jackson
Director, Rates and Regulatory Affairs
Liberty Utilities (Apple Valley Ranchos Water) Corp.
21760 Ottawa Road
Apple Valley, CA 92308-6533

Dear Mr. Jackson,

The Commission has approved Liberty Utilities' (Apple Valley Ranchos Water) Advice Letter No. 244, filed on September 18, 2020, regarding authorization to revise the credit/debit card fee rate contained in Tariff Rule No. 9.

Enclosed are copies of the following revised tariff sheets, effective October 18, 2020, for the utility's files:

P.U.C.	
Sheet No.	Title of Sheet
1033-W	Rule No. 9, Page 4
1034-W	Table of Contents, Page 1

Please contact Carmen Rocha at MDC@cpuc.ca.gov or 415-703-2162, if you have any questions.

Thank you,

/s/ROBIN BRYANT

Robin Bryant
Water Division

Enclosures

**CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
DIVISION OF WATER AND AUDITS**

Advice Letter Cover Sheet

Utility Name: Liberty Utilities (Apple Valley Ranchos Water) Corp.	Date Mailed to Service List: September 18, 2020
District: N/A	
CPUC Utility #: U 346-W	Protest Deadline (20th Day): October 16 2020
Advice Letter #: 244-W	Review Deadline (30th Day): October 26, 2020
Tier <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Compliance	Requested Effective Date: October 18, 2020
Authorization Resolution M-4935	Rate Impact: N/A

Description: Liberty Apple Valley submits this advice letter to request authorization to revise the credit/debit card fee rate contained in Tariff Rule No. 9.

The protest or response deadline for this advice letter is 20 days from the date that this advice letter was mailed to the service list. Please see the "Response or Protest" section in the advice letter for more information.

Utility Contact: Edward N. Jackson

Phone: 562.923.0711

Email: Edward.Jackson@libertyutilities.com

DWA Contact: Tariff Unit

Phone: (415) 703-1133

Email: Water.Division@cpuc.ca.gov

Utility Contact: AnnMarie Lett

Phone: 562.923.0711

Email: AnnMarie.Lett@Libertyutilities.com

DWA USE ONLY

DATE

STAFF

COMMENTS

☐ **APPROVED**

☐ **WITHDRAWN**

☐ **REJECTED**

Signature: _____

Comments: _____

Date: _____



Liberty Utilities (Apple Valley Ranchos Water) Corp.
21760 Ottawa Road
Apple Valley, CA 92308-6533
Tel: 760-247-6484
Fax: 760-247-1654

Advice Letter No. 244-W

September 18, 2020

TO THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Liberty Utilities (Liberty Apple Valley Ranchos Water) Corp. (U 346 W) (“Liberty Apple Valley”) hereby submits the following revised tariff sheets applicable to water service in its service territory:

CPUC Sheet No.	Title of Sheet	Canceling Sheet No.
1033-W	Rule No. 9, Page 4	692-W
1034-W	Table of Contents, Page 1	1032-W

Summary

The purpose for this advice letter is to request authorization to revise the credit/debit card fee rate contained in Tariff Rule No. 9, Rendering and Payment of Bills.

Background and Discussion

On May 17, 2012, Liberty Apple Valley, then Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company, filed Advice Letter 171-W to allow customers to receive billing statements electronically and legally mandated notices electronically, at no extra cost, and add an option to its tariffs allowing customers to pay their bills using a credit or debit card through a third party vendor.

On January 10, 2013, the Commission issued Resolution W-4935 authorizing Liberty Apple Valley to allow customers to receive billing statements and legally mandated notices electronically and added the credit/debit card payment option to its tariffs, Tariff Rule No. 9, Rendering and Payment of Bills. The Commission authorized a convenience fee of \$2.50 per transaction, with a bill limit amount of \$250 for both residential and non-residential customers.

In 2016, Liberty Utilities (“Liberty”) acquired Park Water Company and its subsidiaries. Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company was the subsidiary of Park Water Company. Liberty owns and operates regulated electric, natural gas, water distribution, and wastewater collection utility systems in thirteen states in the United States.

Liberty Apple Valley customers continue to benefit as a direct result of the change in ownership to Liberty. For example, Liberty has negotiated a lower convenience fee for the credit/debit card payment option and increased the number of payment options for customers.

In October 2020, Liberty Apple Valley will change its third party vendor from Paymentus to KUBRA. KUBRA was selected through a competitive bidding process. KUBRA provides greater flexibility for payment options and reduced fees for residential customers. For residential

customers, KUBRA will charge a convenience fee of \$1.75 per transaction with a \$600 bill limit amount and \$7.75 per transaction with a \$1,200 bill limit for non-residential customers. This new fee structure will provide reduced costs to residential customers using the credit/debit card payment option while reducing the number of customers incurring multiple transaction fees.

Only customers choosing to use the credit/debit card payment option incur the convenience charge and no portion of that expense is shifted to customers that do not use the credit/debit card payment option.

Similar to the current process, when customers pay their bill by credit/debit card via the Liberty Apple Valley website or call to make a one-time payment, they are automatically directed to the new third party vendor. Customers are directed to either the KUBRA EZPay web platform or the KUBRA call center IVR (Interactive Voice Response). Liberty Apple Valley does not accept credit payments directly and does not handle or profit from the convenience fee assessed by the third party vendor.

Liberty Apple Valley requests the Commission to approve the new fee structure so that Liberty Apple Valley customers can continue the benefits received under Liberty ownership.

A copy of Resolution W-4935 is included as Attachment A to this advice letter for reference.

Tier Designation

In accordance with General Order 96-A, Water Industry Rule 7.3.1(5), this advice letter is submitted with a Tier 1 designation.

Effective Date

In accordance with General Order 96-A, Water Industry Rule 7.3.1(5), Liberty Apple Valley requests this filing become effective on October 18, 2020.

Notice and Service

In accordance with General Order 96-B, General Rules 4.3 and 7.2, and Water Industry Rule 4.1, a copy of this advice letter will be electronically transmitted on September 18, 2020 to competing and adjacent utilities and other utilities or interested parties having requested such notification. During the COVID-19 pandemic, Liberty Apple Valley can only provide electronic copies of this advice letter to the service list. Pursuant to Water Industry Rule 3.2 of General Order 96-B, public notice is not required.

Response or Protest

Anyone may respond to or protest this advice letter. A response supports the filing and may contain information that proves useful to the Commission in evaluating the advice letter. A protest objects to the advice letter in whole or in part and must set forth the specific grounds on which it is based. These grounds are:

- (1) The utility did not properly serve or give notice of the advice letter;
- (2) The relief requested in the advice letter would violate statute or Commission order or is not authorized by statute or Commission order upon which the utility relies;

- (3) The analysis, calculations, or data in the advice letter contain material error or omissions;
- (4) The relief requested in the advice letter is pending before the Commission in a formal proceeding;
- (5) The relief requested in the advice letter requires consideration in a formal hearing or is otherwise inappropriate for the advice letter process; or
- (6) The relief requested in the advice letter is unjust, unreasonable, or discriminatory, provided that such a protest may not be made where it would require re-litigating a prior order of the Commission.

A protest shall provide citations or proofs where available to allow staff to properly consider the protest. A response or protest must be made in writing or by electronic mail and must be received by the Division of Water within 20 days of the date this advice letter is filed. The address for mailing or delivering a protest is:

Tariff Unit, Water Division, 3rd floor
California Public Utilities Commission
505 Van Ness Avenue, San Francisco, CA 94102
Water.division@cpuc.ca.gov

On the same date the response or protest is submitted to the Water Division, the respondent or protestant shall send a copy by mail (or e-mail) to Liberty Apple Valley, addressed to:

Edward N. Jackson
Director, Rates and Regulatory Affairs
Liberty Utilities (West Region)
9750 Washburn Road
P. O. Box 7002
Downey, CA 90241
Fax: (562) 861-5902
E-Mail: AdviceLetterService@libertyutilities.com

Cities and counties that need Board of Supervisors or Board of Commissioners approval to protest should inform the Division of Water and Audits within the 20-day protest period so that a late filed protest can be entertained. The informing document should include an estimate of the date the proposed protest might be voted on.

If you have not received a reply to your protest within 10 business days, contact Edward Jackson at (562) 923-0711.

Very truly yours,

LIBERTY UTILITIES (APPLE VALLEY RANCHOS WATER) CORP.

/s/ Edward N. Jackson

Edward N. Jackson
Director, Rates and Regulatory Affairs (West Region)
Edward.Jackson@libertyutilities.com

ENJ/aml

Enclosures

LIBERTY UTILITIES
(APPLE VALLEY RANCHOS WATER) CORP.
21760 OTTAWA ROAD
P. O. BOX 7005
APPLE VALLEY, CALIFORNIA 92307-7005

Canceling REVISED Cal. P.U.C. Sheet No. 1033-W
ORIGINAL Cal. P.U.C. Sheet No. 692-W

Rule No. 9

Page 4

RENDERING AND PAYMENT OF BILLS

B. Payment of Bills (continued)

2. Credit/Debit Card Option

At the option of the customer a credit or debit card payment can be made through a third party vendor. For residential customers, a non-refundable convenience fee of \$1.75 per transaction shall apply. For commercial customers, a non-refundable convenience fee of \$7.75 per transaction shall apply. The transaction fee will be over and above the utility bill amount and may be charged to the customer by a third party vendor for this service and will not be on the utility billing statement. For customers with more than one account, a separate transaction fee is necessary for each account. This payment option is not available to customers who have made fraudulent payments within the last 12 months.

(T,R)
(N)
(N)

(To be inserted by utility)	Issued By	(To be inserted by Cal. P.U.C.)
Advice No. <u>244-W</u>	<u>CHRISTOPHER G. ALARIO</u> Name	Date Filed <u>09/18/2020</u>
Dec. No. _____	<u>PRESIDENT</u> Title	Effective <u>10/18/2020</u>
		Resolution No. <u>W-4935</u>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

The following listed tariff sheets contain all effective rates and rules affecting the charges and service of the utility, together with other pertinent information:

<u>Subject Matter of Sheet:</u>	<u>CPUC Sheet No.</u>
Title Page	900-W
Table of Contents	1034-W, 1027-W (T)
Preliminary Statement	993-W, 845-W, 533-W, 670-W, 624-W, 914-W, 923-W, 902-W, 671-W, 892-W 718-W, 719-W, 904-W, 905-W, 906-W, 776-W, 789-W, 888-W, 907-W, 934-W, 994-W, 996-W, 997-W
Service Area Map-Apple Valley Ranchos	653-W
Service Area Map-Yermo	846-W
<u>Rate Schedules:</u>	
Schedule No. 1	Residential General Metered Service-Apple Valley 989-W, 962-W
Schedule No. 1	Residential General Metered Service-Yermo 929-W
Schedule No. 2	Gravity Irrigation Service 990-W, 964-W
Schedule No. 3	Non-Residential General Metered Service-Apple Valley 991-W, 966-W
Schedule No. 3	Non-Residential General Metered Service-Yermo 930-W
Schedule No. 4	Non-Metered Fire Services 992-W, 968-W
Schedule No. 5	Fire Flow Testing Charge 850-W
Schedule No. LC	Late Payment Charge 1028-W
Schedule 14.1	Water Shortage Contingency Plan 804-W through 810-W
Schedule UF	Surcharge to Fund PUC Reimbursement Fee 1031-W
Schedule CARW	California Alternative Rates for Water 861-W, 527-W
Schedule No. CARW-SC	California Alternative Rates for Water Sur-Charge 862-W
<u>LIST OF CONTRACTS AND DEVIATION:</u>	819-W

Rules:

No. 1	Definitions	999-W, 1000-W
No. 2	Description of Service	159-W
No. 3	Application for Service	13-W, 553-W
No. 4	Contracts	361-W
No. 5	Special Information Required on Forms	1022-W, 1023-W, 1001-W, 1002-W
No. 6	Establishment and Re-establishment of Credit	362-W
No. 7	Deposits	711-W, 730-W
No. 8	Notices	1003-W through 1006-W
No. 9	Rendering and Payment of Bills	689-W through 691-W, 1033-W (T)
No. 10	Disputed Bills	1007-W, 1008-W
No. 11	Discontinuance and Restoration of Services	1029-W, 1010-W through 1019-W
No. 12	Information Available to Public	366-W, 367-W
No. 13	Temporary Service	368-W, 369-W
No. 14	Continuity of Service	370-W
No. 14.1	Water Conservation and Rationing Plan	831-W through 842-W
No. 15	Main Extensions	386-W through 392-W, 529-W, 714-W, 715-W, 564-W 396-W through 398-W, 983-W, 984-W
No. 16	Service Connections, Meters, and Customer Facilities	399-W through 405-W

(Continued)

(To be inserted by utility)

Issued By

(To be inserted by Cal.P.U.C.)

Advice No. 244-W

CHRISTOPHER G. ALARIO

Date Filed 09/18/2020

Name

Effective 10/18/2020

Decision No.

PRESIDENT

Title

Resolution No. M-4935

Attachment A
Resolution W-4935

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

DIVISION OF WATER AND AUDITS
Water and Sewer Advisory Branch

RESOLUTION NO. W-4935
January 10, 2013

R E S O L U T I O N

(RES. W-4935), APPLE VALLEY RANCHOS WATER COMPANY (APPLE VALLEY). ORDER APPROVING APPLE VALLEY'S REQUEST TO PERMIT PAYMENT OF WATER BILLS USING A CREDIT OR DEBIT CARD AND ALLOWING APPLE VALLEY'S REQUEST TO PERMIT CUSTOMERS TO RECEIVE THEIR BILLING STATEMENTS ELECTRONICALLY.

By Advice Letter (AL) No. 171-W filed on May 17, 2012.

SUMMARY

This resolution approves Apple Valley's request to add an option to its tariffs that allows customers to pay their bills using a credit or debit card. Apple Valley's request is approved based on the following conditions: 1) Apple Valley charges a transaction fee not to exceed \$2.50 for each transaction; and 2) Apple Valley files a Tier 2 Advice Letter establishing a credit card memorandum account to record all costs associated with the credit card program previously authorized in rates that were or are incurred to support the credit and debit card payment options. The memorandum account shall also include any savings associated with offering the program. The net balance in the memorandum account shall be refunded to customers as part of Apple Valley's next general rate case.

This resolution approves Apple Valley's request to allow customers to receive water bills and most legally mandated notices electronically. Excluded from the credit/debit card payment option are customers who have made fraudulent payments in the last twelve months. Apple Valley is authorized to file a Supplement to Advice Letter No. 171-W to modify Tariff Rule 9 to permit these changes.

BACKGROUND

Apple Valley filed AL No. 171-W on May 17, 2012. In its filing, Apple Valley requests similar treatment as was afforded to Valencia Water Company in Resolution W-4908

January 10, 2013

dated April 19, 2012 pursuant to Industry Rule 8.2 (Request for Similar Treatment) of General Order 96-B. Apple Valley seeks Commission authorization to:

- (1) Continue accepting payment of water bills by credit card pending disposition of this advice letter.
- (2) Amend Tariff Rule 9, Rendering and Payment of Bills to:
 - (a) allow customers to pay their bills using a credit or debit card subject to a transaction fee of \$2.50 per transaction, charged by a third party vendor;
 - (b) exclude from this service those customers who have made fraudulent payments in the last twelve months; and
 - (c) permit customers to receive bills and most legally mandated notices electronically.

NOTICE AND PROTEST

Apple Valley served AL No. 171-W pursuant to the requirements of General Order (GO) 96-B, Rules 4.3 and 7.2, on its GO 96-B Service List. Apple Valley noticed its customers of AL No. 171-W through a bill insert pursuant to requirements of GO 96-B General Rule 4.2 and Water Industry Rule 3.1.

No protests to AL No. 171-W were received by the Division of Water and Audits (DWA).

DISCUSSION

Apple Valley has been offering its customers an option to pay bills by credit or debit card continuously since January 2010. To obtain this service, customers either log on to Apple Valley's website, or through its automated Interactive Voice Response telephone service and are directed to a third party vendor who accepts the credit or debit card payments, charges and collects a transaction fee, interfaces with the credit card company, and pays Apple Valley the amount of the customer's bill. Only customers who use this service are charged the transaction fee by the third party vendor. Apple Valley does not receive any portion of the transaction fee revenue from the third party vendor.

1. Apple Valley's credit/debit card payment option

Apple Valley states that it became aware that it needed to obtain Commission authorization prior to offering a credit/debit card payment option to its customers pursuant to Public Utilities Code § 755 after it received a copy of Draft Resolution W-4908 in February 2012 authorizing credit and debit card services for Valencia Water Company. Apple Valley continues to offer these options and has requested that the

Commission allow it to continue offering the option pending resolution of AL No. 171-W because discontinuation of this service would be an inconvenience to customers who have been using this service.

Compliance with Public Utilities Code § 755

Public Utilities Code § 755 permits water utilities to offer a credit or debit card bill payment option if approved by the Commission. Public Utilities Code § 755 requires that only those customers choosing to use the credit or debit card payment option shall incur the additional charges associated with providing this service, unless and until the Commission determines that the credit or debit card payment option results in savings to ratepayers that exceed the net costs of accepting payment by those cards. (Public Utilities Code § 755(a) (2).)¹ The Commission is required to determine the reasonableness of transaction costs charged to customers that choose to pay their water bills by credit or debit card pursuant to Public Utilities Code § 755(c). If the Commission determines that the savings to the utility corporation exceed the costs to the company, the net savings shall be passed on to the utility corporation's customers. (Public Utilities Code § 755(c) (3).)

Apple Valley believes that its request complies with Public Utilities Code § 755 (a)(2) because only customers that choose to use the credit and debit card payment services will incur the additional costs associated in providing these options, and no portion of these expenses is shifted to customers that do not pay their bills using a credit or debit card.

Apple Valley states that the program is not being offered as a cost savings measure, will not improve the company's profitability, and is being offered as a service to its customers who expect and frequently request this service. Also, savings from its proposed credit and debit card payment program do not exceed the cost of accepting credit cards.

¹ Public Utilities Code § 755 (a)(2) states:

"Only the customers that choose to use the [credit or debit card] payment options incur the additional charge and that no portion of the expense is shifted to customers that do not choose to pay a bill by credit card or debit card, unless and until the commission determines that the savings to ratepayers exceeds the net cost of accepting those cards."

Public Utilities Code § 2107 lists fines that can be imposed on a public utility that violates a Commission order or the Public Utilities Code.² Because Apple Valley does not derive any financial benefits from offering these payment options and the costs involved in doing so are very small, we will not impose a penalty for Apple Valley's failure to comply with Public Utilities Code § 755(b) in this instance. However, we remind Apple Valley that it needs to be cognizant of requirements for Commission authorization mandated in the Public Utilities Code.

2. *Establishment of credit card memorandum account*

There were 1,328 and 4,319 credit card payments processed in 2010 and 2011, respectively. We estimate that Apple Valley will incur ongoing incremental net costs of \$27 per month for time spent by offering the credit/debit card payment option similar to those incurred by Park Water Company, Apple Valley's parent company.³ Apple Valley indicates that it did not incur any legal costs for offering the service. We estimate that Apple Valley's total estimated cost for the program from 2010 through 2012 is \$972.⁴

We conclude that recovery of costs with respect to a credit and debit card program from the general body of non-participating customers should not be permitted given that Apple Valley has not shown that the credit and debit card option offers any net savings at this time. In conjunction with our approval of Apple Valley's request to continue offering customers a credit and debit card payment option, we authorize the

² Public Utilities Code Section 2107 states :

"Any public utility that violates or fails to comply with any provisions of the constitution of this state or of this part, or that fails or neglects to comply with any part or provision of any order, decision, decree, rule, direction, demand, or requirement of the Commission, in a case in which a penalty has not otherwise been provided, is subject to a penalty of not less than five hundred dollars (\$500), nor more than fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000) for each offense."

³ Assuming same costs are incurred by Apple Valley as are reported by Park, its parent company in Advice Letter No. 131. Based on Park Water Company's Advice Letter No. 131, it is assumed that Apple Valley's costs will be \$77 per month for time spent by customer service representatives on the telephone assisting customers for the credit card program. These costs are offset by savings of \$50 per month from an estimated 3 reduced shutoffs associated with timely payment of bills using credit cards.

⁴ Net costs from 1/1/2010 through 12/31/2012 @ \$27/month: \$27/month *36 months = \$972
Total amount before interest: \$972

establishment of a memorandum account and require its incorporation into Apple Valley's tariff by filing a Tier 2 Advice Letter. In this memorandum account, Apple Valley shall record all costs previously authorized in rates that are being used to support the credit and debit card payment options. This would include all ongoing maintenance, operation and capital costs needed to support this payment option. In addition, all cost of noticing the program shall be accounted for in the memorandum account until Apple Valley files its next general rate case. Apple Valley shall also record in this memorandum account any savings arising from the reduced number of shutoffs associated with timely payment of bills using debit or credit cards. The net balance in the memorandum account shall be refunded to customers as part of Apple Valley's next general rate case. Further, in its next general rate case filing, Apple Valley shall remove all costs associated with the debit and credit card payment program that are included in base rates. This will ensure that Apple Valley's credit/debit card payment option is compliant with Public Utilities Code § 755.

3. Reasonableness of transaction fee

Apple Valley states that it is using the same third party vendor, Paymentus, as its parent company, Park Water Company, to offer the credit and debit card services. The selection of the vendor was based on the vendor's experience in offering such services, flexibility with fees, settlement time, and consolidation of deposits. Park Water Company negotiated a transaction fee of \$2.50 per transaction with the third party vendor for providing the credit/debit card service. No competitive bidding was used for vendor selection.

We find that a transaction fee of \$2.50 per transaction for this optional service is a reasonable charge. In view of the fact that the customer base using this optional service is small, Apple Valley is unable to obtain volume discounts that larger utilities are able to receive for offering this service. Furthermore, the transaction fee of \$2.50 per transaction is the same as that approved for Valencia Water Company in Resolution W-4908, dated April 19, 2012. Apple Valley's request is reasonable and Tariff Rule 9 should be modified accordingly. Further, Apple Valley is reminded that before any increase in the transaction fee can be instituted it must seek authorization from the Commission.

4. Excluding certain customers from credit card/debit card services

Apple Valley seeks to exclude from the credit/debit card program customers who have made fraudulent payments in the past twelve months.

We believe that customers who have made fraudulent payments over the past twelve months should be excluded from being offered the credit/debit card payment option because they pose an extra level of collection risk. We agree with DWA staff's recommendation that Apple Valley's request is reasonable and Tariff Rule 9 should be

modified to not extend the credit/debit card payment option to customers who have made fraudulent payments in the past twelve months.

5. *Availability of electronic statements*

Apple Valley seeks to provide customers the option to receive regular bills for service electronically, and to receive most legally mandated notices electronically at the same time the customer is provided the electronic bill.⁵

Customers should be given the option, at no extra cost, to receive electronically regular bills for service and other legally mandated notices and to no longer receive these items in paper format. We agree with DWA staff's recommendation that Apple Valley's request is reasonable and authorize modification of Tariff Rule 9 to reflect this change.

6. *Extending returned check fees for other financial institutions*

Apple Valley proposes to amend its tariffs to extend the returned check charge to all forms of payment, including payment made by a credit or debit card, that are subsequently dishonored by any financial institution or payment processor.

The language in the tariffs should be amended to impose a charge on all forms of payments that may be returned by financial institutions or a payment processor. This will permit Apple Valley to charge customers who make the dishonored payments, rather than requiring the general body of ratepayers to absorb these costs as part of authorized rates. We agree with DWA staff's recommendation that Apple Valley's request is reasonable and Tariff Rule 9 should be modified to extend a dishonored check-payment charge to cover all transactions where a financial institution or payment processor rejects a payment.

COMMENTS

Public Utilities Code § 311(g) (1) provides that resolutions generally must be served on all parties and subject to at least 30 days public review and comment prior to a vote of the Commission. This is an uncontested matter that grants the relief requested. Pursuant to Public Utilities Code § 311(g) (2), this Resolution was not circulated for public comment.

⁵ Apple Valley will continue to provide written notices of termination of service in accordance with Rule No. 8.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

1. Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company (Apple Valley) has been offering its customers the option to pay their water bills by credit or debit card since 2010.
2. Public Utilities Code § 755 requires Commission approval prior to offering a credit/debit card bill payment option to customers of a water corporation.
3. Apple Valley continued offering the credit/debit card bill payment option even after learning that Commission approval was required prior to offering credit/debit card services.
4. Public Utilities Code § 2107 lists fines that can be imposed on a public utility that violates a Commission order or requirement of the Public Utilities Code.
5. Apple Valley did not profit from offering the option for bill payment by credit/debit card and the costs Apple Valley incurred for offering this service were small. It is reasonable to not impose a penalty on Apple Valley for offering a credit/debit card payment option without Commission authorization in this instance.
6. Apple Valley needs to be cognizant of requirements for Commission authorization mandated in the Public Utilities Code.
7. Apple Valley filed AL No. 171-W requesting authority to: (a) continue to offer its water customers a credit/debit card bill payment option; (b) allow customers to receive electronically their bills and most legal notices, and (c) not extend the credit/debit card payment option to customers who have made fraudulent payments within the last twelve months.
8. All revenues arising from transaction fees paid for making payments using a credit or debit card flow directly to the third party vendor.
9. Customers who do not use the credit or debit card bill payment option service are not charged any costs related to providing this service.
10. Public Utilities Code § 755 permits water utilities to offer a credit or debit card bill payment option if approved by the Commission.
11. Public Utilities Code § 755 requires that only those customers choosing to use the credit or debit card bill payment option incur the additional charges associated with providing this service, unless the Commission determines that the credit or debit card bill payment option results in savings to ratepayers that exceed the net costs of accepting payment by those cards.
12. Public Utilities Code § 755 requires the Commission to determine the reasonableness of transaction costs charged to customers who choose to pay their water bills using the credit or debit card bill payment option pursuant to this section.

13. Apple Valley proposes a transaction fee of \$2.50 per transaction to be collected by Apple Valley's third party vendor from customers who opt to pay their water bill using a credit or debit card.
14. It is reasonable for customers to pay a transaction fee of \$2.50 for using a credit or debit card to pay water bills.
15. Public Utilities Code § 755 requires the Commission to determine how any associated costs or potential savings from credit or debit card bill payment are passed on to the customers.
16. Apple Valley was not charged by its vendor for enhancements required to offer credit/debit card service.
17. A new credit card memorandum account should be established. Apple Valley should file a Tier 2 Advice Letter to incorporate the credit card memorandum account into its tariff.
18. Apple Valley should record all costs previously authorized in rates that are being used to support the credit and debit card payment options including all ongoing maintenance, operation and capital costs pertaining to the credit/debit card option in a credit card memorandum account. Apple Valley should also record in this memorandum account any savings arising from the reduced number of shutoffs associated with timely payment of bills using debit or credit cards. The net balance in the memorandum account should be refunded to customers as part of Apple Valley's next general rate case.
19. Apple Valley should remove all costs associated with the debit and credit card payment program that are included in base rates in its next general rate case.
20. It is reasonable for Apple Valley to record the net costs for providing credit/debit card bill payment services starting with the effective date of its credit/debit card program. The memorandum account is the appropriate mechanism for recording all costs and savings associated with providing credit/debit card bill payment services.
21. Apple Valley's cost/savings analysis, based on Park Water Company's experiences, indicates that Apple Valley incurred \$972 for the credit card program from 2010 through 2012. That amount plus interest should be recorded in the credit card memorandum account.
22. It is reasonable to expect additional costs to collect from customers who have made fraudulent payments in the past.
23. It is reasonable to exclude customers who have made fraudulent payments in the past twelve months from participating in credit/debit card bill payment option.
24. Financial institutions may reject payments made electronically.

25. It is reasonable to modify the Tariff Rule No. 9 to establish a credit/debit card bill payment program consistent with Appendix A attached to this Resolution and to extend a dishonored payment charge to cover all transactions where a financial institution or a payment processor rejects a payment.
26. It is reasonable to permit customers to receive, at no extra charge, billing statements and other legally mandated notices electronically. Apple Valley should file a supplement to Advice Letter No. 171-W modifying Tariff Rule No. 9 - Rendering and Payment of Bills, consistent with Appendix A attached to this Resolution.

THEREFORE IT IS ORDERED THAT:

1. Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company's Advice Letter No. 171-W is approved consistent with directions provided below. Tariff Rule No. 9 - Rendering and Payment of Bills shall be modified consistent with the authorization in this Resolution to: 1) allow customers the option to receive electronically at no extra charge billing statements and legal and mandated notices; 2) offer an optional credit/debit card bill payment option to all customers; and 3) extend the dishonored check payment charge to all dishonored checks and electronic payments consistent with the language shown in Appendix A of this Resolution, and to concurrently cancel the presently effective tariff sheets. Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company shall file a supplement to Advice Letter No. 171-W within five days of the effective date of this Resolution that includes tariff language consistent with Appendix A of this Resolution.
2. Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company's proposal to continue to allow customers to pay their water bills by credit or debit card on an optional basis is approved. The charge for offering such a service shall not exceed \$2.50 per transaction to be paid by those customers who use this service.
3. Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company is authorized to establish a credit card memorandum account.
4. Within thirty days of this Resolution, Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company is ordered to file a Tier 2 advice letter, to incorporate a credit card memorandum account authorized by this Resolution into its tariff and to record all costs and savings associated with providing credit/debit card payment services. The balance in the memorandum account shall be refunded to the general body of ratepayers as part of Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company's next general rate case.

January 10, 2013

5. Apple Valley Ranchos Water Company, as part of its next general rate case, shall remove all ongoing costs associated with providing credit/debit card payment options from its base rates consistent with Public Utilities Code Section 755.
6. This Resolution is effective today.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was duly introduced, passed and adopted at a conference of the Public Utilities Commission of the State of California held on January 10, 2013; the following Commissioners voting favorably thereon:



PAUL CLANON
Executive Director

MICHAEL R. PEEVEY
President

MICHEL PETER FLORIO
CATHERINE J.K. SANDOVAL
MARK J. FERRON
Commissioners

APPENDIX A
Sheet 1

Rule No. 9

RENDERING AND PAYMENT OF BILLS

A. Rendering of Bills

Bills for service will be rendered each customer on a monthly or bi-monthly basis at the option of the utility, unless otherwise provided in the rate schedule.

At the customer's request, the utility may be requested to provide either paper or electronic bills for rendered service, but not both. (N)

The customer may elect to receive and view regular bills for service and other legal and mandated notices electronically and to no longer receive paper bills and legal and mandated notices. Customers requesting this option may be required to complete additional forms and agreements. Legal and mandated notices shall be included with the utility's electronic means of bill delivery; except however, all notices of termination of service shall be made in accordance with Rule No. 8. The customer may discontinue electronic billing upon 30 days prescribed notice. (N)

1. Metered Service (L)

- a. Meters will be read at regular intervals for the preparations of periodic bills and as required for the preparation of opening bills, closing bills, and special bills.
 - b. The opening bill for metered service will not be less than the established monthly minimum of readiness-to-serve charge for the service. Any amount paid in excess of the prorated charges otherwise applicable to the opening period will be credited against the charge for the succeeding regular billing period, except that no such credit shall accrue if the total period of service is less than one month.
 - c. It may not have always been practicable to read meters at intervals which will result in a billing period of equal numbers of days.
- (1) Should a monthly billing period contain less than 27 days or more than 33 days a pro rata correction in the amount of the bill will be made. (L)

(continued)

APPENDIX A
Sheet 2

Rule No. 9

RENDERING AND PAYMENT OF BILLS
(continued)

- (2) The charge for metered service for a bi-monthly period will be computed by doubling the monthly minimum or readiness-to-serve charge and the number of cubic feet to which each block rate is applicable on a monthly basis. (L)
 - (3) For billing periods other than monthly or bi-monthly, adjustments will be made proportionate to that for a monthly billing period.
 - d. Bills for metered service will show at least the reading of the meter at the end of the period for which the bill is rendered, the meter constant, if any, the number and kind of units, and date of the current meter reading.
 - e. Each meter on a customer's premises will be considered separately and the readings of two or more meters will not be combined except where a combination of meter readings is specifically provided for in the applicable rate schedule, or where the utility's operating convenience of necessity may require the use of more than one meter or a battery of meters. In the latter case, the monthly minimum or readiness-to-serve charges will be prorated from the monthly minimum or readiness-to-serve charges of the applicable rate schedule upon the basis of a meter size equivalent in diameter to the total combined discharge areas of such meters.
2. Flat Rate Service
- a. Bills for flat rate service are payable in advance.
 - b. The opening bill for flat rate service will be the established monthly charge for the service. Any amount paid in excess of the prorated charges otherwise applicable to the opening period will be credited against the charge for the succeeding regular billing period, except that no such credit shall accrue if the total period of service is less than one month.
 - c. For billing periods other than monthly, the charge for flat rate service will be computed by multiplying the monthly charge by the number of months in the billing period. (L)

(continued)

APPENDIX A
Sheet 3

Rule No. 9

RENDERING AND PAYMENT OF BILLS
(continued)

3. Proration of Bills

(L)

- a. The charges applicable to opening periods, closing bills, and bills rendered for periods corresponding to less than 27 days or more than 33 days for monthly billing periods will be computed as follows:

(1) Metered Service

The amount of the minimum charge (and the quantity allowed therefore) or the readiness-to-serve charge and the quantity in each of the several quantity rate blocks will be prorated on the basis of the ratio of the number of days in the period to the number of days in an average billing period. The measured quantity of usage will be applied to such prorated amounts and quantities.

(2) Flat Rate Service

The billing period charge will be prorated on the basis of the ratio of the number of days in the period to the number of days in an average billing period.

(3) Average Billing Period

The number of days in an average billing period is defined as 365 divided by the number of billing periods in a year. (It is 30.4 days for a monthly billing period.)

B. Payment of Bills

Bills for service are due and payable upon presentation and payment may be made at any commercial office of the utility or to any representative of the utility authorized to make collections. Collection of closing bills may be made at the time of presentation.

(L)

1. The utility may charge \$12.00 for any bad check or electronic fund transfer not honored by the customer's financial institution or a payment processor.

(N)

(continued)

APPENDIX A
Sheet 4

Rule No. 9

RENDERING AND PAYMENT OF BILLS
(continued)

B. Payment of Bills (continued)

2. Credit/Debit Card Option

At the option of the customer a credit or debit card payment can be made through a third party vendor. A non-refundable transaction fee of \$2.50 per transaction shall apply. The transaction fee will be over and above the utility bill amount and may be charged to the customer by a third party vendor for this service and will not be on the utility billing statement. For customers with more than one account, a separate transaction fee is necessary for each account. This payment option is not available to customers who have made fraudulent payments within the last 12 months.

(N)

(N)

(End of APPENDIX A)

**LIBERTY UTILITIES (APPLE VALLEY RANCHOS WATER) CORP.
ADVICE LETTER 244-W
SERVICE LIST**

Jim Hansen
Navajo Mutual Water Company
P. O. Box 392
Apple Valley, CA 92307
jhansenjr@email.com

Town of Apple Valley
Attention: Frank Robinson
14955 Dale Evans Parkway
Apple Valley, CA 92307
dcron@applevalley.org

Manuel Benitez
County of San Bernardino
Special Districts Department
Water and Sanitation Division
12402 Industrial Blvd.
Bldg. D, Ste. 6
Victorville, CA 92392

California Public Utilities Commission
Attention: Ting-Pong Yuen
ORA Water
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
tpy@cpuc.ca.gov

Samuel Martinez
Executive Officer
Local Agency Formation Commission
1170 West 3rd Street, Unit 150
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0490
lafco@lafco.sbcounty.gov

Patrick Scanlon
Vice President Operations
Golden State Water Company
1920 West Corporate Way
Anaheim, CA 92801
Patrick.Scanlon@gswater.com

Perry Dahlstrom
District Manager
Mountain Desert
Golden State Water Company
13608 Hitt Road
Apple Valley, CA 92308
Perry.Dahlstrom@gswater.com

Ronald Moore
Senior Regulatory Analyst
Golden State Water Company
630 East Foothill Blvd
San Dimas, California 91773
rkmoore@gswater.com

Kendall MacVey
Best Best & Krieger LLP
PO Box 1028
Riverside, CA 92502
kendall.macvey@bbklaw.com

Joshua Nelson
Best Best & Krieger LLP
500 Capitol Mall, Suite 1700
Sacramento, CA 95818
joshua.nelson@bbklaw.com